

Minutes of the 4th Meeting of the Myanmar National REDD+ Taskforce

Date:	6 July, 2018
Venue:	Royal Kaytumadi Hotel, Taungoo
Time:	09:00 – 12:30
Objective of the meeting:	To update the Taskforce on progress in REDD+ initiatives in Myanmar, and to discuss the way forward for the Taskforce
Chair:	Dr. Thaung Naing Oo, representing U Kyaw Kyaw Lwin, Deputy Director General, Forest Department
Participants:	
Taskforce members	U Mg Mg Lwin, Deputy Director, Planning Department, MOPF, U Kyaw Lwin, Director, Department of Planning, MOALI, U Than Htut, Director, Department of Agricultural Land Management and Statistics, MOALI, U Ohn Lwin, Director, Department of Mines, MONREC Daw Nilar Aung, Assistant Director, Department of Agriculture, MOALI U Myo Nyi Nyi, Assistant Director, General Administered Department, U Aung Thant Zin, CEO, MERN, Daw Naw Ei Ei Min, Director, POINT Daw Yamin Shwe Yi, Senior Manager, CSR Department, KBZ Bank
Taskforce Secretary	Dr. Thaung Naing Oo, Director, Forest Research Institute (FRI), Forest Department, National Programme Director, UN-REDD Programme, Myanmar
Observers/Donors	Mr. Alexis Corblin, Regional Technical Advisor, UN Environment, Daw Zin Myo Thu, Head of Office, IUCN, , Dr. Tint Lwin Thaung, Director, TNC, Mr. Franz Arnold, Chief Technical Advisor, FAO Myanmar, Mr. Timothy Boyle, Chief Technical Advisor, UN-REDD Programme, Myanmar, Daw Khin Hnin Myint, Programme Coordinator, UN-REDD Programme, Myanmar, U Thein Zaw Win, Communication Officer, UN-REDD Programme, Myanmar, U Min Soe, Stakeholder Engagement Officer, UN-REDD Programme, Myanmar, Daw Phyoo Pa Pa Han, Programme Assistant, REDD+ National Programme, Myanmar, Daw Thinn Thitsar Kyaw, Project Assistant, FAO

Agenda item 1: Opening

The meeting was opened with remarks by the Secretary, Dr. Thaung Naing Oo, Director of the Forest Research Institute, representing the Chair, U Kyaw Kyaw Lwin, Deputy Director of Forest Department. In his opening, he

Agenda item 2: Action taken to follow up on Decisions reached at the 3rd meeting of the Taskforce

Daw Khin Hnin Myint reported on the implementation of decisions reached at the 3rd meeting of the TF. Progress can be seen in the table below.

No.	Decision	Action Taken
3/1	Initially, the mandate of the Taskforce to provide guidance and oversight to "REDD+ relevant" project and programmes will adopt the criterion that such programmes and projects should contribute directly to one or more of the four elements of the Warsaw Framework for REDD+	No action required
3/2	The Taskforce requested that the UN-REDD Programme should regularly update the database of programmes and projects that may contribute to REDD+.	The database has been updated, and is presented to the 4 th meeting of the Taskforce as Document 4/6
3/3	The Taskforce requested the UN-REDD Programme to provide more information on the issues that need to be taken into account in the negotiation of any bilateral initiatives related to emission reductions from forests.	Further information is presented in Document 4/4
3/4	In preparation for the 4 th meeting of the Taskforce, which will focus on approval of the National REDD+ Strategy, the UN-REDD Programme is requested to circulate the revised version to Taskforce members well in advance of the meeting to allow them to prepare.	The revised version of the Strategy was circulated to TF members on 18/06/2018; and is presented as Document 4/5
3/5	Given the importance of mangroves for REDD+, the information exchange session of the 4 th meeting will focus on mangroves.	An information session on mangroves has been prepared

Further information on follow-up to Decision 3/3 was provided in a separate agenda item (see Agenda item 5, below).

In addition, follow-up action to Decision Supplemental 3 of the 2nd meeting of the Taskforce was presented, as at the 3rd meeting of the Taskforce, follow-up on this decision was omitted in error. Decision TF2/Supp 3 states:

"The TF will review only the final versions of those documents directly related to the "Warsaw Framework for REDD+". At its 3rd meeting, the TF will decide which of these documents should be referred to higher levels for approval"

The follow-up action undertaken was a proposal from the REDD+ Office regarding processes for approval of relevant documents:

Document	Approval process
----------	------------------

National REDD+ Strategy [and Investment Plan]	TF endorses and refers to NECCCCC for approval
Forest Reference Level (or Forest Emissions Reference Level)	TF endorses and refers to Minister of MONREC for approval
Design of the National Forest Monitoring system	TF approves
Design of the Safeguard Information System	TF approves
BUR Technical Annex containing REDD+ results	TF endorses and refers to NECCCCC for approval
Summary of Information on how the Cancun Safeguards have been addressed and respected	TF endorses and refers to NECCCCC for approval

Discussion

Members of the Taskforce discussed whether the ToR of the NECCCCC (and its Working Groups) include authority to approve documents. The representative of the Planning Department asked for clarification on the relationship between the Taskforce and the NECCCCC. In response, Dr. Thaug Naing Oo referred to Decision 2/3 of the Taskforce: "*TF Secretary will prepare regular 3-month progress reports, and the TF Chair will report to DG and Minister on progress of REDD+ in order that this information can be presented at NECCCCC meetings*". He noted that this information flow had not yet happened.

The Taskforce reached the following decisions related to the approval of REDD+ documents:

Decision 4/1: The Taskforce defers making a decision on approval of Phase 3 documents (BUR Technical Annex and SOI) until Myanmar is in Phase 3.

Decision 4/2: The Taskforce instructs the Secretary to obtain clarification as to whether the NECCCCC (and its Working Groups) have the authority to approve documents.

Decision 4/3: The Taskforce approves the proposal of the REDD+ Office regarding approval of Phase 1 documents, subject to clarification under Decision 4/2.

Dr. Tint Lwin Thaug (TNC, Observer), proposed that the database incorporate information on achievements by projects related to REDD+ in Myanmar.

Decision 4/4: The Taskforce instructs the Secretary to further develop the database of REDD+ related projects by adding information on achievements of each project.

Agenda item 3: Progress on REDD+ in Myanmar

Dr. Thaug Naing Oo described the progress on REDD+ in Myanmar in the context of the Warsaw Framework for REDD+, by the UN-REDD Programme, and by projects funded by ICIMOD and the Korean Forest Service. Under the UN-REDD Programme, the REDD+ strategy was revised with the comments and suggestions received by sub-national consultations, public consultation, individual group meetings and Drivers and Strategies TWG meeting. The FREL is assessing by UNFCCC's technical assessment team and the final version of FREL for approval is expected in November this year. The development of overall sampling design and field manual for National Forest Monitoring System is on progress. An addition to the UN-REDD support, the NFI/NFMIS project funded by Finnish Government will be started soon. As part of SIS (safeguard information system) setting, the national clarification on safeguard based on the benefits and risk of PaMs and PLR review is underway.

Through ICIMOD project, series of capacity building trainings such as training on REDD+ basic concept, forest inventory, carbon measurement and management of forest, livelihood improvement and nursery management were conducted for the government officials and communities in the project area.

Under the KFS project, the carbon stock and biodiversity survey have been accomplished and the training on Community Forestry and Agroforestry were conducted. Distribution of efficient stove to the community in the project area is one of its supports.

Daw Naw Ei Ei Min, the Director of POINT briefly presented the progress of the project "Community Forestry & Customary Land Tenure in the Context of REDD+ in Myanmar". The project developed several IEC materials and provided trainings and awareness/advocacy programme related to customary land tenure and rights and community mapping.

Discussion

Taskforce members and observers discussed a number of issues related to progress on REDD+:

- Clarification was requested on the relationship between the MRRP and NDC, and the 30% target for PFE;
- It was noted that there are relatively few projects or initiatives working of strengthening forest law enforcement;
- For REDD+ to be successful, those who are "problem-makers" need to become partners – how can this be affected?
- With regard to safeguards, information is needed on the relationship between REDD+ PAMs and safeguards. Also, information needs extend beyond the forest sector to other development sectors. What is the role of women in REDD+ in Myanmar?

Decision 4/5: The Taskforce instructs the Secretary to prepare a briefing on the role of women in REDD+ in Myanmar, for presentation to the 5th meeting of the Taskforce.

Agenda item 5: Further information on the issues that need to be taken into account in the negotiation of any bilateral initiatives related to emission reductions from forests

Mr. Timothy Boyle, CTA, UN-REDD/Myanmar, gave a presentation on five issues emerging from Document 3/5, presented to the 3rd meeting of the Taskforce. These are:

1. Any bilateral forest carbon initiatives which involve a transfer of title to forest ERs and involve the GoM as the seller would make it harder to achieve emission reduction targets specified in the NDC.
2. Bilateral (and multilateral) forest carbon mechanisms use methods for calculating emission reductions and an emission "baseline" that are similar to, but usually differ to some degree from those used under REDD+.
3. The potential to increase revenues from forest ERs depends on the relative prices paid under REDD+ and the bilateral (or multilateral) mechanisms.
4. The timing of receiving revenues is difficult to predict.
5. Transactions of forest ERs that do not involve Parties to the UNFCCC are not affected by Article 4 of the PA¹.

Further information was provided on each of these issues, leading to the conclusions/recommendations:

	REDD+ only	Mixed mechanisms
--	------------	------------------

¹ Since the Paris Agreement applies only to Parties to the UNFCCC, transactions of Er's that do not involve Parties to the UNFCCC are not bound by the terms of the Agreement

Costs	Considered as the default	Costs higher due to need for registry and (especially) reconciliation of MRV data
Revenues	Assume \$5/tonne (maybe discounted if through GCF)	Probably similar – prices similar and most mechanisms also discount or have buffers ... could be higher if Gov not a party BUT additional costs of C-rights legislation
Risks	As defined in NRS	Risks higher – e.g., potential for conflicts among beneficiaries of different mechanisms
Benefits	As defined in NRS	Difficult to predict; depends in part on safeguards systems of different mechanisms

- From a purely technical perspective, there are no clear reasons to pursue non-REDD+ mechanisms.
- There may be other reasons (e.g., political) to pursue non-REDD+ mechanisms. An objective, quantitative assessment of whether the non-technical reasons for pursuing other mechanisms outweigh the technical reasons not to is not possible.
- However, the decision should be based on a clear understanding of the costs, revenues, risks and benefits of the alternative mechanism
- The GoM should insist that an analysis clarifying costs, revenues, risks and benefits should be conducted by the party proposing the non-REDD+ mechanism before any agreement is signed, so as to allow the GoM to take an informed decision

Taskforce members and observers discussed this information and reached the following two decisions:

Decision 4/6: The Taskforce requested that a further agenda item on this topic be included at its 5th meeting

Decision 4/7: The Taskforce agreed that the GoM should insist that an analysis clarifying costs, revenues, risks and benefits should be conducted by the party proposing the non-REDD+ mechanism before any agreement is signed, so as to allow the GoM to take an informed decision.

Agenda item 7: The revised National REDD+ Strategy

Due to lack of time, this agenda item was deferred to the next meeting of the Taskforce.

Agenda item 9: Updates on mangrove initiatives related to REDD+

Daw Zin Myo Thu, Head of Office, IUCN Myanmar Programme shared about the project “Integrating Mangroves into REDD+ Implementation in Myanmar” which is funded by Norad. The project is aimed to have better protect to the Mangrove Forests in Myanmar with National REDD+ Instruments. The project implementation will be started in 2019 with the duration of 3 years. It will cover 5 districts under Ayeyarwaddy, Rakhine and Tanintharyi Region. The project expects to have REDD+ responsive revised DFMPs (District Forest Management Plans) by covering 30,000 hectares of Mangroves outside PEF (Permanent Forest Estate) into Reserved Forests, Community Forests and Community Protected Areas. The project will try to strengthen the capacity of District Forest Officers to engage stakeholders in mangrove management.

Decisions and Action points

- Decision 4/1:** The Taskforce defers making a decision on approval of Phase 3 documents (BUR Technical Annex and SOI) until Myanmar is in Phase 3.
- Decision 4/2:** The Taskforce instructs the Secretary to obtain clarification as to whether the NECCCC (and its Working Groups) have the authority to approve documents.
- Decision 4/3:** The Taskforce approves the proposal of the REDD+ Office regarding approval of Phase 1 documents, subject to clarification under Decision 4/2.
- Decision 4/4:** The Taskforce instructs the Secretary to further develop the database of REDD+ related projects by adding information on achievements of each project.
- Decision 4/5:** The Taskforce instructs the Secretary to prepare a briefing on the role of women in REDD+ in Myanmar, for presentation to the 5th meeting of the Taskforce.
- Decision 4/6:** The Taskforce requested that a further agenda item on this topic be included at its 5th meeting
- Decision 4/7:** The Taskforce agreed that the GoM should insist that an analysis clarifying costs, revenues, risks and benefits should be conducted by the party proposing the non-REDD+ mechanism before any agreement is signed, so as to allow the GoM to take an informed decision.

Next meeting

The next Taskforce meeting will be scheduled in September 2018.

Attachments

- Agenda of the meeting
- Attendance list

Minutes approved by
On behalf of Chair



Dr. Thaung Naing Oo
Secretary of National REDD+ Task Force
Director, Forest Research Institute, Forest Department

4th Meeting of Myanmar REDD+ Task Force

Annex 1: Agenda

No.	Time	Items	Facilitation
1	09:00 - 09:10	Opening remarks	Dr. Thaung Naing Oo, Director of Forest Research Institute, Forest Department (on behalf of Chair)
2	09:10 – 09:25	Action taken to follow up on Decisions reached at the 3rd meeting of the Taskforce (Document TF4/2)	Khin Hnin Myint, Programme Coordinator, UN-REDD
3	09:25 – 09:45	Progress on REDD+ in Myanmar and under the UN-REDD Programme in Myanmar; including plans for requests to the TF for approval of REDD+ related documents (Document TF 4/3)	Dr. Thaung Naing Oo, National Programme Director, UN-REDD Programme, Secretary to the Task Force
4	09:45 – 10:00	Questions & Answers	Chair
5	10:00 – 10:10	Further information on the issues that need to be taken into account in the negotiation of any bilateral initiatives related to emission reductions from forests (responding to Decision 3 from the 3 rd meeting of the TF) (Document TF 4/4)	Mr. Timothy Boyle, Interim CTA, UN-REDD Programme Daw
6	10:10 – 10:30	Questions & Answers	Chair
7	10: 30 – 10:45	The revised National REDD+ Strategy (Document TF4/5)	Khin Hnin Myint, Programme Coordinator, UN-REDD
8	10:45 – 11:15	Questions & Answers	Chair
9	11:15 – 11:55	Updates on mangrove initiatives related to REDD+	Daw Zin Myo Thu, Head of Office IUCN Myanmar
10	11:55 – 12:00	Closing remarks	Dr. Thaung Naing Oo, Director of Forest Research Institute, Forest Department (on behalf of Chair)
11	12:00	Lunch	

4th Meeting of Myanmar REDD+ Task Force

Annex 2: Attendance

No.	Name	Title	Organization/ Ministry	Email	Contact No.
1	U Than Htut	Director	Department of Agricultural Land Management and Statistics	slrdstatistics@gmail.com	09- 250242633/ 067-412127
2	U Mg Mg Lwin	Deputy Director	Planning Department, MOPF	kolwinmg@gmail.com	09- 420726288
3	U Kyaw Lwin	Director	Department of Planning, MOALI	kyawlwin kop@gmail.com	067-410528
4	U Ohn Lwin	Director	Department of Mines	uohnlwin1961@gmail.com	09-31492337
5	Dr. Thuang Naing Oo	Director	Forest Research Institute, Forest Department, MONREC	tnoo71@gmail.com	09- 448533635
6	U Myo Nyi Nyi	Assistant Director	General Administration Department	komyonyinyi9@gmail.com	09-96606969
7	Daw Zin Myo Thu	Head of Office	IUCN	zinmyo.thu@iucn.org	09-5506557
8	Mr. Alexis Corblin	Regional Technical Advisor	UN Environment	alexis.corblin@un.org	
9	Mr. Timothy Boyle	Chief Technical Advisor	UN-REDD Programme	timothy.boyle@undp.org	09- 952323984
10	Daw Yamin Shwe Yi	Senior Manager	CSR Department, KBZ Bank	yaminshwe.yee@gmail.com	09-5056785
11	U Aung Thant Zin	CEO	MERN	mern.myanmar@gmail.com	09- 448016358
12	Mr. Ben Vickers	Programme Officer	FAO	ben.vickers@fao.org	
13	Mr. Franz Arnold	Chief Technical Advisor	FAO	franz.arnold@fao.org	
14	Ma Naw Ei Ei Min	Director	POINT	point.director@gmail.com	09- 254000363
15	U Tint Lwin Thaung	ED	TNC	tint.thaung@tinory	
16	Daw Nilar Aung	Assistant Director	Department of Agriculture, MOALI	nilaraung7@gmail.com	09-8627621
17	Daw Khin Hnin Myint	National Programme Coordinator	UN-REDD Programme	khin.hnin.myint@undp.org	09- 420114720
18	U Min Soe	Stakeholder Engagment Oficer	UN-REDD Programme	min.soe@undp.org	09- 256000883

19	U Thien Zaw Win	Communications Officer	UN-REDD Programme	thein.zaw.win@undp.org	09-254186907
20	U Aung Myo Myint Oo	ICT Assistant	UNDP	aung.myo.myint.oo@undp.org	09-977182797
21	Daw Phyo Pa Pa Han	Programme Assistant	UN-REDD Programme	phyo.pa.pa.han@undp.org	09-252270424
22	Daw Thinn Thitsar Kyaw	Project Assitant	FAO	Thinn.kyaw@fao.org	09-97305393
23	Daw Phyu Phyu San	Observer		phyuphyusan.san@gmail.com	09-2030496